EXECUTIVE SUMMARY - ENFORCEMENT MATTER

Page 1 of 2

DOCKET NO.: 2008-0108-WR-E **TCEQ ID:** RN104949680 **CASE NO.:** 35214

RESPONDENT NAME: Carr Land Development LLC

ORDER TYPE:					
X_1660 AGREED ORDER	FINDINGS AGREED ORDER	FINDINGS ORDER FOLLOWING SOAH HEARING			
FINDINGS DEFAULT ORDER	SHUTDOWN ORDER	IMMINENT AND SUBSTANTIAL ENDANGERMENT ORDER			
AMENDED ORDER	EMERGENCY ORDER	·			
CASE TYPE:					
AIR	MULTI-MEDIA (check all that apply)	INDUSTRIAL AND HAZARDOUS WASTE			
PUBLIC WATER SUPPLY	PETROLEUM STORAGE TANKS	OCCUPATIONAL CERTIFICATION			
WATER QUALITY	SEWAGE SLUDGE	UNDERGROUND INJECTION CONTROL			
MUNICIPAL SOLID WASTE	RADIOACTIVE WASTE	X WATER RIGHTS			
SITE WHERE VIOLATION(S) OCCURRED: Carr Land Development Tuscany Park Estates, on the west side of State Highway 37, 0.8 mile north of the intersection of State Highway 37 and Farm-to-Market Road 564, Mineola, Wood County TYPE OF OPERATION: Refurbished reservoir SMALL BUSINESS: _X_YesNo					
OTHER SIGNIFICANT MATTERS: There are no complaints. There is no record of additional pending enforcement actions regarding this facility location.					
INTERESTED PARTIES: No one other than the ED and the Respondent has expressed an interest in this matter.					
COMMENTS RECEIVED: The Texas Register comment period expired on June 23, 2008. No comments were received.					
CONTACTS AND MAILING LIST: TCEQ Attorney/SEP Coordinator: None TCEQ Enforcement Coordinator: Mr. Harvey Wilson, Enforcement Division, Enforcement Team 3, MC 149, (512) 239-0321; Mr. Bryan Sinclair, Enforcement Division, MC 219, (512) 239-2171 Respondent: Mr. Joe Carr, Owner, Carr Land Development LLC, 215 County Road 2910, Mineola, Texas 75773 Respondent's Attorney: Not represented by counsel on this enforcement matter					

VIOLATION SUMMARY CHART:					
VIOLATION INFORMATION	PENALTY CONSIDERATIONS	CORRECTIVE ACTIONS TAKEN/REQUIRED			
Type of Investigation: Complaint Routine	Total Assessed: \$1,575 Total Deferred: \$315	Ordering Provisions: The Order will require the Respondent to:			
Enforcement Follow-up X Records Review Date(s) of Complaints Relating to this	X Expedited Settlement Financial Inability to Pay	a) Within 30 days after the effective date of this Agreed Order:			
Case: None Date of Investigation Relating to this	SEP Conditional Offset: \$0 Total Paid to General Revenue: \$1,260	i. Submit a completed application to TCEQ for a permit to impound water at the			
Case: October 31, 2007 Date of NOV/NOE Relating to this Case:	Site Compliance History Classification	Tuscany Park Estates Site location as required by 30 Tex. ADMIN. CODE ch. 297; and			
December 21, 2007 (NOE) Background Facts: This was a routine	Person Compliance History Classification High X Average Poor	ii. Respond completely and adequately, as determined by the TCEQ, to all requests for information concerning the permit			
record review. WATER	Major Source:YesX No	application within 30 days after the date of such requests or by any other deadline specified in writing.			
Failure to obtain a water right permit for the impoundment of waters of the state in	Applicable Penalty Policy: September 2002	b) Within 45 days after the effective date of the Agreed Order, submit written			
the six acre reservoir located in Tuscany Park in Mineola, Texas [30 Tex. ADMIN. CODE § 297.11 and Tex. WATER CODE §		certification of compliance with Ordering Provision a.			
11.143].		c) Within 180 days after the effective date of this Agreed Order, submit written certification that either a permit authorizing the impounding of water has been obtained or that operation has ceased until			
		appropriate authorization is obtained.			

Additional ID No(s).: TXR15EP49

Policy Revision 2 (Septe		alty C	alculatio	n Work	sheet (P	•	sion November 6, 2007
TCEQ DATES Assigned PCW	21-Dec-2007 16-Jan-2008 S	creening	14-Jan-2008	EPA Due			
RESPONDENT/FACILITY Respondent Reg. Ent. Ref. No. Facility/Site Region	Carr Land Develo RN104949680	oment LL(3	Major	/Minor Source	Minor	
CASE INFORMATION Enf./Case ID No. Docket No. Media Program(s) Multi-Media Admin. Penalty \$ L	2008-0108-WR-E Water Rights	\$0	Maximum				n 3
		Pena	Ity Calcul	ation Sec	tion		
TOTAL BASE PENAL	TY (Sum of vic					Subtotal 1	\$1,500
ADJUSTMENTS (+/-) Subtotals 2-7 are obtain Compliance Histo	ed by multiplying the T	_ 1 otal Base Pe	NY 1. ANY TANÀNA MARANDANA MANDRANDANA MANDRANDANA MANDRANDANA MANDRANDANA MANDRANDANA MANDRANDANA MANDRANDANA	by the indicated pe		otals 2, 3, & 7	\$75
Τ	An enhancement			e the Respond			,
Gulpability	No		0%	6 Enhancement		Subtotal 4	\$0
Notes	The Res	oondent d	oes not meet th	ne culpability c	riteria.		
Good Faith Effort	elonio del contrato de la contrato d		0%			Subtotal 5	\$0
Extraordinary Ordinary · N/A Notes	X (m	ark with x)	RP/Settlement Offer		riteria.		
			00	/ = / ·		Subtotal 6	\$0
Approx. C	Total EB Amounts Cost of Compliance	\$29 \$250		6 Enhancement* ed at the Total EB	\$ Amount	Subtotal 0	Ψ0
SUM OF SUBTOTALS	3 1-7					Final Subtotal	\$1,575
OTHER FACTORS AS Reduces or enhances the Final Su				0%		Adjustment	\$0
Notes						000000000000000000000000000000000000000	
_					Final Pe	nalty Amount	\$1,575
STATUTORY LIMIT A	DJUSTMENT				Final Ass	essed Penalty	\$1,575
DEFERRAL Reduces the Final Assessed Pena	alty by the indicted per	centage. <i>(Er</i>	nter number only; e	20 % e.g. 20 for 20% red		Adjustment	-\$315
Notes	De	eferral offe	ered for expedit	ed settlement.			
PAYABLE PENALTY							\$1,260

Screening Date 14-Jan-2008

Docket No. 2008-0108-WR-E

PCW

Respondent Carr Land Development LLC

Case ID No. 35214

Reg. Ent. Reference No. RN104949680

Media [Statute] Water Rights Enf. Coordinator Harvey Wilson Policy Revision 2 (September 2002) PCW Revision November 6, 2007

Compliance History Worksheet

Component	Number of	Enter Number Here	Adjust
NOVs	Written NOVs with same or similar violations as those in the current enforcement action (number of NOVs meeting criteria)	4.7	5%
	Other written NOVs	0	0%
	Any agreed final enforcement orders containing a denial of liability (number of orders meeting criteria)	Ó	0%
Orders	Any adjudicated final enforcement orders, agreed final enforcement orders without a denia of liability, or default orders of this state or the federal government, or any final prohibitory emergency orders issued by the commission		0%
Judgments	Any non-adjudicated final court judgments or consent decrees containing a denial of liability of this state or the federal government (number of judgements or consent decrees meeting criteria)		0%
and Consen Decrees	Any adjudicated final court judgments and default judgments, or non-adjudicated final cour judgments or consent decrees without a denial of liability, of this state or the federa government		0%
Convictions	Any criminal convictions of this state or the federal government (number of counts)	0	0%
Emissions	Chronic excessive emissions events (number of events)	0	0%
Audits	Letters notifying the executive director of an intended audit conducted under the Texas Environmental, Health, and Safety Audit Privilege Act, 74th Legislature, 1995 (number of audits for which notices were submitted)		0%
, wand	Disclosures of violations under the Texas Environmental, Health, and Safety Audit Privilege Act, 74th Legislature, 1995 (number of audits for which violations were disclosed)	0	0%

Environmental management systems in place for one year or more No 0% Voluntary on-site compliance assessments conducted by the executive director under a No 0% special assistance program Other Participation in a voluntary pollution reduction program No 0% Early compliance with, or offer of a product that meets future state or federal government No 0% environmental requirements

Adjustment Percentage (Subtotal 2)

>> Repeat Violator (Subtotal 3)

No

Adjustment Percentage (Subtotal 3)

>> Compliance History Person Classification (Subtotal 7)

Average Performer

Adjustment Percentage (Subtotal 7)

>> Compliance History Summary

Compliance History Notes

An enhancement is recommended because the Respondent received a NOV for the same violation.

Total Adjustment Percentage (Subtotals 2, 3, & 7)

Screening Date	14-Jan-2008 Docket No. 200	8-0108-WR-E PCW
Respondent	Carr Land Development LLC	Policy Revision 2 (September 2002)
Case ID No.		PCW Revision November 6, 2007
Reg. Ent. Reference No.		
Media [Statute] Enf. Coordinator		
Violation Number		
Rule Cite(s)	30 Tex. Admin. Code § 297.11 and Tex. Water	er Code § 11.143
Violation Description	Failed to obtain a water right permit for the impoundmen six acre reservoir located in Tuscany Park in	
	·	Base Penalty \$5,000
>> Environmental, Property a	nd Human Health Matrix	
	Harm	
Release OR · Actual Potential	Major Moderate Minor Per	cent 0%
>>Programmatic Matrix		
Falsification	Major Moderate Minor X Per	cent 10%
Matrix Notes	100% of the rule requirement was not met	
	Adju	stment \$4,500
		\$500
Na Lice English		
Violation Events		
Number of Vi	plation Events 3 76 Nu	mber of violation days
mark only one with an x	daily x quarterly semiannual annual single event	Violation Base Penalty \$1,500
Three mon	thly events are recommended from the date of the record r until the date of screening on January 14, 20	
Economic Benefit (EB) for th	is violation St	atutory Limit Test
Estimate	d EB Amount \$29	Violation Final Penalty Total \$1,575
	This violation Final Assessed	Penalty (adjusted for limits) \$1,575
	This Violation I mai Assessed	Totally (authored for mine)

	Е	conomic I	Benefit W	orks	heet		
Respondent		elopment LLC				1 1 1 1 1 1 1	
Case ID No.					1.4	Samuel Service	
Reg. Ent. Reference No.	RN104949680					***************************************	
Media	Water Rights					Percent Interest	Years of
Violation No.	1					1 Grown merese	Depreciation
						5.0	18
	Item Cost	Date Required	Final Date	Yrs	Interest Saved	Onetime Costs	EB Amount
Item Description							
Rempescription	140 COHIHAS OF Ψ					•	2,600,600
Delayed Costs							
Equipment				0,0	\$0	\$0	\$0
Buildings				0,0	\$0	\$0	\$0
Other (as needed)				0.0	\$0	\$0	\$0
Engineering/construction				0.0	\$0	\$0	\$0
Land				0,0	\$0	n/a	\$0
Record Keeping System				0,0	\$0	n/a	\$0
Training/Sampling				0,0	\$0	n/a	\$0
Remediation/Disposal		Y. S. S. S.		0.0	\$0	n/a	\$0
Permit Costs	\$250	14-Jul-2006	31-Oct-2008	2.3	\$29	n/a	\$29
Other (as needed)				0.0	\$0	n/a	\$0
Notes for DELAYED costs Avoided Costs	the Respor	ndent was made aw	vare of the non-co	mpliance	e. Final Date is th	rtificate: Date Require estimated date of one-time avoided constitutions.	compliance.
Disposal		1.1		0.0	\$0	\$0	\$0
Personnel				0.0	\$0	\$0	\$0
Inspection/Reporting/Sampling				0.0	\$0	\$0	\$0
Supplies/equipment				0,0	\$0	\$0	\$0
Financial Assurance [2]				0.0	\$0	\$0	\$0
ONE-TIME avoided costs [3]				0,0	\$0	\$0	\$0
Other (as needed)				0.0	\$0	\$0	\$0
Notes for AVOIDED costs							
<u>ц</u>							

Compliance History

Site Rating: 6.00

TXR15EP49

Customer/Respondent/Owner-Operator: CN603140807 CARR LAND DEVELOPMENT LLC Classification: AVERAGE Rating: 6.00 RN104949680 CARR LAND DEVELOPMENT Regulated Entity: Classification: AVERAGE **TUSCANY PARK ESTATES** ID Number(s): **STORMWATER PERMIT** On the west side of State Highway 37, 0.8 miles north of Location: Rating Date: 9/1/2007 the intersection of State Highway 37 and Farm-to-Market Repeat Violator: NO Road 5641 **REGION 05 - TYLER** TCEQ Region: Date Compliance History Prepared: January 14, 2008 Agency Decision Requiring Compliance History: Enforcement Compliance Period: January 14, 2003 to January 14, 2008 TCEQ Staff Member to Contact for Additional Information Regarding this Compliance History Name: Harvey Wilson Phone: 239-0321 **Site Compliance History Components** 1. Has the site been in existence and/or operation for the full five year compliance period? Yes 2. Has there been a (known) change in ownership of the site during the compliance period? No 3. If Yes, who is the current owner? N/A 4. if Yes, who was/were the prior owner(s)? N/A 5. When did the change(s) in ownership occur? N/A Components (Multimedia) for the Site :-A. Final Enforcement Orders, court judgements, and consent decrees of the state of Texas and the federal government. N/A Any criminal convictions of the state of Texas and the federal government. B. C. Chronic excessive emissions events. D. The approval dates of investigations. (CCEDS Inv. Track. No.) 1 12/21/2007 (574276)E. Written notices of violations (NOV). (CCEDS Inv. Track. No.) Date: 08/25/2006 (490001)Self Report? Classification: Moderate Citation: 2B TWC Chapter 11, SubChapter A 11.143 Failure to obtain a water right permit for the impoundment of waters of the state. Description: Self Report? NO Classification: Moderate 30 TAC Chapter 281, SubChapter A 281.25(a)(4) Citation: Description: Failure to obtain a storm water permit for construction activities. F. Environmental audits. N/A G Type of environmental management systems (EMSs). Voluntary on-site compliance assessment dates. H.

J. Early compliance.

Participation in a voluntary pollution reduction program.

N/A

Sites Outside of Texas

N/A

in the second of the second of

A Company of the Comp

TEXAS COMMISSION ON ENVIRONMENTAL QUALITY



IN THE MATTER OF AN	§	BEFORE THE
ENFORCEMENT ACTION	§	
CONCERNING	§	TEXAS COMMISSION ON
CARR LAND DEVELOPMENT LLC	§	
RN104949680	8	ENVIRONMENTAL QUALITY

AGREED ORDER DOCKET NO. 2008-0108-WR-E

I. JURISDICTION AND STIPULATIONS

At its ______ agenda, the Texas Commission on Environmental Quality ("the Commission" or "TCEQ") considered this agreement of the parties, resolving an enforcement action regarding Carr Land Development LLC ("the Respondent") under the authority of Tex. WATER CODE ch. 11. The Executive Director of the TCEQ, through the Enforcement Division, and the Respondent appear before the Commission and together stipulate that:

- 1. The Respondent owns property that includes a refurbished reservoir located on the west side of State Highway 37, 0.8 mile north of the intersection of State Highway 37 and Farm-to-Market Road 564 in Mineola, Wood County, Texas (the "Site").
- 2. The Respondent's Site adjoins, is contiguous with or surrounds state water as defined in TEX. WATER CODE § 11.021 and 30 TEX. ADMIN. CODE § 297.1(46).
- 3. The Commission and the Respondent agree that the Commission has jurisdiction to enter this Agreed Order, and that the Respondent is subject to the Commission's jurisdiction.
- 4. The Respondent received notice of the violations alleged in Section II ("Allegations") on or about December 26, 2007.
- 5. The occurrence of any violation is in dispute and the entry of this Agreed Order shall not constitute an admission by the Respondent of any violation alleged in Section II ("Allegations"), nor of any statute or rule.
- 6. An administrative penalty in the amount of One Thousand Five Hundred Seventy-Five Dollars (\$1,575) is assessed by the Commission in settlement of the violations alleged in Section II

("Allegations"). The Respondent has paid One Thousand Two Hundred Sixty Dollars (\$1,260) of the administrative penalty and Three Hundred Fifteen Dollars (\$315) is deferred contingent upon the Respondent's timely and satisfactory compliance with all the terms of this Agreed Order. The deferred amount will be waived upon full compliance with the terms of this Agreed Order. If the Respondent fails to timely and satisfactorily comply with all requirements of this Agreed Order, the Executive Director may require the Respondent to pay all or part of the deferred penalty.

- 7. Any notice and procedures, which might otherwise be authorized or required in this action, are waived in the interest of a more timely resolution of the matter.
- 8. The Executive Director of the TCEQ and the Respondent have agreed on a settlement of the matters alleged in this enforcement action, subject to the approval of the Commission.
- 9. The Executive Director may, without further notice or hearing, refer this matter to the Office of the Attorney General of the State of Texas ("OAG") for further enforcement proceedings if the Executive Director determines that the Respondent has not complied with one or more of the terms or conditions in this Agreed Order.
- 10. This Agreed Order shall terminate five years from its effective date or upon compliance with all the terms and conditions set forth in this Agreed Order, whichever is later.
- 11. The provisions of this Agreed Order are deemed severable and, if a court of competent jurisdiction or other appropriate authority deems any provision of this Agreed Order unenforceable, the remaining provisions shall be valid and enforceable.

II. ALLEGATIONS

As owner of the Site, the Respondent is alleged to have failed to obtain a water right permit for the impoundment of waters of the state in the six acre reservoir located in Tuscany Park, Mineola, Texas, in violation of 30 Tex. Admin. Code § 297.11 and Tex. Water Code § 11.143, as documented during a record review conducted on October 31, 2007.

III. DENIALS

The Respondent generally denies each allegation in Section II ("Allegations").

IV. ORDERING PROVISIONS

1. It is, therefore, ordered by the TCEQ that the Respondent pay an administrative penalty as set forth in Section I, Paragraph 6 above. The payment of this administrative penalty and the Respondent's compliance with all the terms and conditions set forth in this Agreed Order resolve only the allegations in Section II. The Commission shall not be constrained in any manner from requiring corrective action or penalties for violations which are not raised here. Administrative penalty payments shall be made payable to "TCEQ" and shall be sent with the notation "Re: Carr Land Development LLC, Docket No. 2008-0108-WR-E" to:

Financial Administration Division, Revenues Section Attention: Cashier's Office, MC 214 Texas Commission on Environmental Quality P.O. Box 13088 Austin, Texas 78711-3088

- 2. It is further ordered that the Respondent shall undertake the following technical requirements:
 - a. Within 30 days after the effective date of this Agreed Order, submit a completed application to TCEQ for a permit to impound water at the Tuscany Park Estates Site location as required by 30 TEX. ADMIN. CODE ch. 297.

The application shall be submitted to:

Water Rights Permits MC 160 Water Supply Division Texas Commission on Environmental Quality P.O. Box 13087 Austin, Texas 78711-3087

- b. Respond completely and adequately, as determined by the TCEQ, to all requests for information concerning the permit application within 30 days after the date of such requests or by any other deadline specified in writing;
- c. Within 45 days after the effective date of this Agreed Order, submit written certification of compliance with Ordering Provision No. 2.a., as described in Ordering Provision No. 2.e. below;
- d. Within 180 days after the effective date of this Agreed Order, submit written certification that either a permit authorizing the impounding of water has been obtained or that operation has ceased until appropriate authorization is obtained, as described in Ordering Provision No. 2.e. below; and
- e. The certification shall include detailed supporting documentation including photographs, receipts, and/or other records to demonstrate compliance. The certification shall be notarized by a State of Texas Notary Public and include the following certification language:

"I certify under penalty of law that this document and all attachments were prepared under my direction or supervision in accordance with a system designed to assure that qualified personnel properly gather and evaluate the information submitted. Based on my inquiry of the person or persons who manage the system, or those persons directly responsible for gathering the information, the information submitted is, to the best of my knowledge and belief, true, accurate, and complete. I am aware that there are significant penalties for submitting false information, including the possibility of fine and imprisonment for knowing violations."

The certification shall be submitted to:

Carr Land Development LLC DOCKET NO. 2008-0108-WR-E Page 4

Order Compliance Team Enforcement Division, MC 149A Texas Commission on Environmental Quality P.O. Box 13087 Austin, Texas 78711-3087

with a copy to:

Water Section, Manager Tyler Regional Office Texas Commission on Environmental Quality 2916 Teague Drive Tyler, Texas 75701-3756

- 3. The provisions of this Agreed Order shall apply to and be binding upon the Respondent. The Respondent is ordered to give notice of the Agreed Order to personnel who maintain day-to-day control over the Site operations referenced in this Agreed Order.
- 4. If the Respondent fails to comply with any of the Ordering Provisions in this Agreed Order within the prescribed schedules, and that failure is caused solely by an act of God, war, strike, riot, or other catastrophe, the Respondent's failure to comply is not a violation of this Agreed Order. The Respondent shall have the burden of establishing to the Executive Director's satisfaction that such an event has occurred. The Respondent shall notify the Executive Director within seven days after the Respondent becomes aware of a delaying event and shall take all reasonable measures to mitigate and minimize any delay.
- 5. The Executive Director may grant an extension of any deadline in this Agreed Order or in any plan, report, or other document submitted pursuant to this Agreed Order, upon a written and substantiated showing of good cause. All requests for extensions by the Respondent shall be made in writing to the Executive Director. Extensions are not effective until the Respondent receives written approval from the Executive Director. The determination of what constitutes good cause rests solely with the Executive Director.
- 6. This Agreed Order, issued by the Commission, shall not be admissible against the Respondent in a civil proceeding, unless the proceeding is brought by the OAG to: (1) enforce the terms of this Agreed Order; or (2) pursue violations of a statute within the Commission's jurisdiction, or of a rule adopted or an order or permit issued by the Commission under such a statute.
- 7. This agreement may be executed in multiple counterparts, which together shall constitute a single original instrument. Any executed signature page to this Agreement may be transmitted by facsimile transmission to the other parties, which shall constitute an original signature for all purposes.
- 8. Under 30 Tex. ADMIN. Code § 70.10(b), the effective date is the date of hand-delivery of the Order to the Respondent, or three days after the date on which the Commission mails notice of the Order to the Respondent, whichever is earlier. The Chief Clerk shall provide a copy of this Agreed Order to each of the parties.

en de la companya de la co

e de la compagnetación de parameter a antico de la específica de la compagnetación de la compagnetación de la La compagnetación de la capación de la compagnetación de la compagnetación de la compagnetación de la compagne La compagnetación de la capación de

Application of the property of th

en en la companya de la companya del companya de la companya del companya de la companya del la companya de la

en transporter de la company de la compa La company de la company d La company de la company d

Carr Land Development LLC

SIGNATURE PAGE

TEXAS COMMISSION ON ENVIRONMENTAL QUALITY

For the Commission	
For the Executive Director	Date 6/2/2008
attached Agreed Order on behalf of the e	and the attached Agreed Order. I am authorized to agree to the entity indicated below my signature, and I do agree to the terms her acknowledge that the TCEQ, in accepting payment for the uch representation.
 timely pay the penalty amount, may result A negative impact on compliance Greater scrutiny of any permit app Referral of this case to the Attorney fees, or Increased penalties in any future of Automatic referral to the Attorney TCEQ seeking other relief as auth 	history; plications submitted; ney General's Office for contempt, injunctive relief, additional to a collection agency; enforcement actions; y General's Office of any future enforcement actions; and
Signature	3-30-2008 Date
Joe Carr Name (Printed or typed) Authorized Representative of	Title

Instructions: Send the original, signed Agreed Order with penalty payment to the Financial Administration Division, Revenues Section at the address in Section IV, Paragraph 1 of this Agreed Order.

we will sent the wife my time. and the second second

(a) The approximate for the effective transfer of the effective process. The effective process is a second of the effective process. The effective process is a second of the effective process. April 18 Sept. St. Barrier B.

Andrew Color State of the Color of the Color

i produce de la companya de la comp Companya de la compa

5-30-2002

OWNER

Park to the state of the state